Students' Narrative Writing : An Error Analysis

Indah Khairunnisa[1], Shynta Amalia[2], Rizqy Dwi Amrina[3]
[1,2,3]Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang
Email: indahkhairunnisa508@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The objective of this research was to investigate the kinds of errors on using simple past tense in writing narrative text at ninth grade students at SMP N 4 Rambutan. The research design used in this study was quantitative descriptive. The sampling technique to choose 1 class which consist of 30 students were used cluster random Sampling . The data was collected through students' writing task. After got the data, the results of this study showed that there were errors made by students in the use of the simple past tense. The errors are categorized into 4, consisting of omission, misformation, addition, and misordering. First, there are 39 or 31.70% omission. Second, there are 69 or 56.09% misformation. Third, there are 11 or 8.94% addition. Finally, there are 4 or 3.25% misordering. In summary, misformation is the most dominant type of error that appeared in students' narrative text writing.

Keywords: *error analysis, narrative text, simple past tense, writing.*

Introduction

The importance of communication is growing in this age of globalization, which is still developing today. In order to communicate internationally, usually everyone uses English because English is an international language. Harmer (2007), states that English is employed in every facet of people's lives, including the arts, the economy, information transmission, and social knowledge. Therefore, the existence of English in the education system in Indonesia is very useful for children's lives because it is used in almost all global sources of information in various aspects of life.

In English lessons, there are four important skills in English, one of which is called writing. Based on Huy (2015), writing is important because students could enhance their vocabulary, grammar as well as language in the process of writing. In short, writing is an important process for understanding English well and learning English is not just about sound.

Writing is not easy, because there are many skills that can be used in it. In accordance with Ramdhani & Amalia (2018), writing is one of the productive language abilities, yet it

is difficult for students to master. In summary, writing is not easy in learning English.

Meanwhile, one of the problems in Indonesia is the lack of ability in writing. According to Purap & Purwono (2021), the problem that occurs is that literacy activities in Indonesia are quite low. These problems are proven in the PISA 2018 results which are considered representative enough to measure the level of language skills, especially students' writing skills. This directly becomes a factor that the students' lack of writing ability.

In the same way, writing narrative text in Indonesia is still very low. Many students still experience difficulties. As in the case study conducted by Purwantini (2022), the average result of writing narrative texts students at SMP Negeri 8 Madiun is that of 32 students, 17 students have completed it, while 15 other students have not yet completed it. In addition, as in the case study conducted by those researchers, with the results it can be seen that students experience difficulties and in this case there will also be errors in writing.

Later on, learning narrative text is also learning simple past tense in it. According

to Bieber (1999), In fiction, where the use of the past to depict fictitious past events is a well-established norm, the past tense most frequently alludes to past time via some past point of reference. In short, narrative text is related to the past tense because it tell about past events.

The preliminary study was conducted by interviewing the students at SMP N 4 Rambutan. When the researcher asked to several students and the students responds "I have learned to make narrative text", this also stated "it's true that sometimes I find it difficult to make it, miss" (R&A, Personal Comunnication, January 5th,2023). Based on the interview, it can be concluded that there are indeed difficulties in writing. Since they find it difficult, it is assumed they make errors in writing narrative text.

There are several previous related studies that have been conducted to determine are the students' error in writing narrative text at ninth grade students of junior high school. First, refering to the research and discussion by Fitria et al (2022), the errors that students made when writing narrative text was examined using a descriptive qualitative. Then, the findings showed that the biggest percentage of errors 48.04% of misformations was made. Second, a study conducted by Setti (2018), found that the most percentage of errors 63% were misformation. Third, refers to research and discussion by Riska (2019), this research used quantitative method with the most common error was misformation with the total error was 76 errors or 50%. Fourth, as study conducted by Majid (2014), this study used a qualitative descriptive method and the the most dominant error, especially in information errors (85,45%).Then the last, refering to research and discussion by Pardosi et al (2019), the researcher used a qualitative descriptive method and the higher errors were misinformation (54.17%).

Based on previous related studies above, many of these studies used descriptive qualitative and there were differences in the population in their research such as some who do research on junior high school, senior high school, and University. Therefore,the researcher would like to found the gap by conducted the research that focuse on

quantitative study and focused on using simple past tense. The research also has that the study that focused on the ninth grade junior high school is still limited and need to be explored.

Based on the above description, researcher would like to examine all the errors made by the learners in writing narrative texts. Researcher wants to know the ability of SMP N 4 Rambutan students to write narrative texts. Therefore, the researcher will conduct a study under the title "An error analysis of using simple past tense in writing narrative Texts at ninth grade students at SMP N 4 Rambutan".

Method

The concern of this research was to investigate the errors that the students' made in writing narrative text. Quantitative research was used to analyze students' writing error in narrative text. The sampling technique that used by researcher in this study is cluster random Sampling. The sample of this research were 30 students of the ninth grade students SMP N 4 Rambutan.

This research was collected the data by using writing task. Writing task is a test used to test a participant's ability to select and report the main idea, to describe and compare data, identify trends in factual information or describe a process. The topic gave by the researcher is in accordance with the syllabus of 2013 Curriculum Class 9, regarding narrative text in the form of short folk legends, such as Maling Kundang, Toba Lake, and Gold Cucumber. The researcher did the task twice by giving the task that the student made before to make sure that what the student made is an error not a mistake.

There are various methods for analyzing the data after it has been collected from the student-made narrative writing test. The following are the steps to carry out an error analysis research, according to Ellis et al (1997): (1)Identifying the error, (2)Describing error, (3)Explaining or interpreting error,and (4)Evaluating error.

after the researcher got the results of the analysis, in addition to evaluating the error by ensuring that the error is correct there were validators for the analysis carried out by the researcher based on the types of error.The researcher calculated the percentage of data from the narrative writing task using the

formula below:
Formula:

$$P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100\%$$

P = Percentage of error
F = Frequency of error occurred
N = Number of cases.

Findings and Discussion
Findings

After collecting data conducted on grade 9 junior high school students at public junior high school 4 rambutan. Researcher found several types of errors made by students in narrative text writing in using simple past tense. There are 123 errors found in students' narrative text writing.Based on Dulay's theory (1982), the types of errors can be divided into 4 categories, omission, addition, misformation and misordering errors.The identification of all these errors can be seen in the following table:

Table 1
Kinds of Errors in Narrative text made by the students

NO	Type of error	Total of error	
		In Number	In Percentage
1.	Omission	39	31,70%
2.	Misformation	69	56,09%
3.	Addition	11	8,94%
4.	Misordering	4	3,25%
	Total	123	100%

Table1 showed kinds of error made by students and there are consisted of 39 omission error (31.70%), 69 misformation errors (56.09%), 11 addition errors (8.94%), and 4 misordering errors (3.25%) which was made by students.

omission error

In the results of identification and classification of errors in writing simple past tense in narrative text writing, there are 39 errors in omission. Out of these 39 errors, 35 errors were classified as -d/-ed omission errors. The example sentences of the errors made by the students, such as "Finally, his mother pray to god" became "Finally, his mother *prayed* to god". In the other sentence "He live in small village near beach" became "He *lived* in small village near beach".All of these errors showed

that students had difficulty using -d and -ed endings at the end of verbs.

In addition, among all the omission made by students, 4 errors were identified that were classified as omission of auxiliary verbs such as "was and were". Example sentences of omission made by students, such as "His name Malin* Kundang" became "His name *was* Malin Kundang", then "Because* embarrassed saw his mother" instead of "Because *He was* embarrassed saw his mother". In other sentence "His mother* angry and cry" became "His mother *was* angry and cry". And last "In ancient times * a family consisting of 1 mother and 1 child" instead of "In ancient times, there *was* a family consisting of 1 mother and 1 child". The table below showed some the errors made by students :

Table 2
The example of Omission error

No	Error Sentences	Correct sentences	types
1.	His name Malin* Kundang	His name *was* Malin Kundang	Auxillary Verb (was)
2.	A time, Malin Kundang *decide* to going	A time, Malin Kundang *decided* to go	Suffix-d / -ed
3.	Because* embarrassed saw his mother	Because *He was* embarrassed saw his mother	Auxillary Verb (was)
4.	Malin *pretend* not to know his mother	Malin *pretended* not to know his mother	Suffix-d / -ed
5.	His mother* angry and cry	His mother *was* angry and cry	Auxillary Verb (was)
6.	He always *help* his mother	He always *helped* his mother	Suffix-d / -ed
7.	His mother *earn* money	His mother *earned* money	Suffix-d / -ed
8.	He then *curse* immediately	He then *cursed* immediately	Suffix-d / -ed
9.	Mother's Malin *curse* became real	Mother's Malin *cursed* become real	Suffix-d / -ed
10.	His mother was angry and *cry*	His mother was angry and *cried*	Suffix-d / -ed
11.	They *live* happily	They *lived* happily	Suffix-d / -ed
12.	They *live* in very simple santu house	They *lived* in very simple santu house	Suffix-d / -ed
13.	Once upon a time, there *live* grandmother	Once upon a time, there *lived* grandmother	Suffix-d / -ed
14.	She *live* alone	She *lived* alone	Suffix-d / -ed
15.	They *live* in very simple santu house	They *lived* in very simple santu house	Suffix-d / -ed

misformation Error

There were 69 misformation errors found in the students' writing narrative text. From 69 errors, 68 misformation errors are categorized as alternative forms, where students have written sentences using simple present tense or using first form verbs. Example sentences of misformation made by students, such as "Malin kundang *send* money to his mother" became "Malin kundang *sent* money to his mother", then "Farmers *forget* their promise" instead of "Farmers *forgot* their promise".

In addition, students also make misformation error sentences in using the auxiliary verbs "was, were and did". The Example sentence made by students, such as

"Who *is* in the village" became "Who *was* in the village". Then, "Malin *is* marry with the king's daughter" instead of "Malin *was* marry with the king's daughter". In other sentence, "He *is* also very spoiled" instead of "He *was* also very spoiled".

Furthermore, 1 misformation error was found which is categorized in archi-form, where there is an error in the plural or singular. Example sentences of arch-form, such as " There *was* a mother and her son" the correct one was "There *were* mother and her son". The example of omission errors made by students can be seen in the table below :

Table 3
The example of Misformation error

NO	Error Sentences	Correct Sentences	types
1.	There *was* a mother and her son	There *were* mother and her son	Archi-form
2.	He *forgotten* about his mother	He *forgot* about his mother	Alternative form
3.	Malin kundang *give* a job	Malin kundang *gave* a job	Alternative form
4.	Malin *is* marry with the king's daughter	Malin *was* marry to the king's daughter	Alternative form
5.	Mande rubayah waited for the return of Malin kundang but never *comeback*	Mande rubayah waited for the return of Malin kundang but never *cameback*	Alternative form
6.	Malin Kundang *comeback* to birth place	Malin Kundang *cameback* to birth place	Alternative form
7.	The legend of toba lake *tells* of a girl	The legend of toba lake *told* of a girl	Alternative form
8.	He *saying* that toba	He *said* that toba	Alternative form
9.	Toba *is* a child of fish	Toba *was* a child of fish	Alternative form
10.	The only income *is* only when fishing	The only income *was* only when fishing	Alternative form
11.	One day, there *is* a husband	One day, there *was* a husband	Alternative form
12.	Planting cucumber *grow*	Planting cucumber *grew*	Alternative form
13.	Timun Mas *run* away	Timun Mas *ran* away	Alternative form
14.	The cucumber plants only *bear* one fruit	The cucumber plants only *bore* one fruit	Alternative form
15.	The color *is* golden	The color *was* golden	Alternative form

addition error

There are 11 addition errors that have been found in student writing, 10 of which are categorized in the addition of double marking, namely adding auxiliary verbs "was, were and did" and added other verbs in the sentence. The example sentences of addition made by students, such as "Malin *did* wanted to go home" instead of "Malin wanted to go home". In other sentence, "She didn't *lived* alone" instead of " She didn't *live* alone".

In addition to the addition of double marking, 1 addition error was found which was categorized as simple addition. The example sentence such as, "Grandma forgot her conditions" the correct one was "Grandma forgot her condition". The example of addition errors that students have made can be seen in the table below:

Table 4
The example of Addition error

No	Error Sentences	Correct sentences	types
1.	Malin *did* wanted to go home	Malin wanted to go home	Double Marking
2.	His mother *was* woke up	His mother woke up	Double Marking
3.	Malin Kundang's mother did not *agreed*	Malin Kundang's mother did not agree	Double Marking
4.	The giant was able to *passed* through it	The giant was able to pass through it	Double Marking
5.	She *was* lived alone	She lived alone	Double Marking
6.	She *was* took care	She took care	Double Marking
7.	Grandma forgot her *conditions*	Grandma forgot her *condition*	Simple addition
8.	Timun mas grew *was* into a beautiful girl	Timun mas grew into a beautiful girl	Double Marking
9.	Mother did not *approved*	Mother did not *approve*	Double Marking
10.	Mother did not *wanted* bad things	Mother did not *want* bad things	Double Marking
11.	She didn't *lived* alone	She didn't *live* alone	Double Marking

misordering error

There are 4 misordering errors that have been found in students' writing. These errors are misplaced words in sentences. Examples of misordering errors in student writing, such as "*He then* curse" became "*Then he* cursed", Then "Because only she lives alone" instead of "Because she only lived alone". In other sentence "*Lake toba* is one of the lakes" instead of "*Toba lake* is one of the lakes". And also in sentence "*Mother's Malin* curse" the correct one was "*Malin Mother's* cursed". All errors made by students can be seen in the table below:

Table 5
Misordering error

No	Error Sentences	Correct sentences	types
1.	*He then* curse	*Then he* cursed	Misordering
2.	Because only she lives alone	Because she only lived alone	Misordering
3.	*Lake toba* is one of the lakes	*Toba lake* is one of the lakes	Misordering
4.	*Mother's Malin* curse	*Malin Mother's* cursed	Misordering

Discussion

This research has the highest score which was 69 and the percentages was 56.09%, the finding was similar to Riska (2019) with the results of the study had misformation as the highest score with 76 and the percentages were 50%. In addition, the research from fitria et.al (2022), with the result showed that the most

common error is misformation with 49 or 48.04%. So, it can be concluded that the errors made by students occur in misformation happened because of errors in the used of improper morpheme forms or structures.

The second highest error was omission as many as 39 or 31.70%. This error occurs because students omit the suffix -d / -ed and omit the Auxillary Verb (was, were, or did). For example "Buto ijo *want* timun mas" instead of "Buto ijo *wanted* timun mas". In this example, the student omitted the suffix -ed. In another sentence "In ancient times * a family consisted of 1 mother and 1 child" instead of "In ancient times there *was* a family consisting of 1 mother and 1 child". In this example, the student omits was as the auxillary verb. The finding of this research was similar to Anwar (2014) the result of this were omission with 40 errors or 26%. It can be concluded that students also do not fully understand irregular and regular verbs.

Third error was addition, there were 11 or 8.94%. Students added what should not be needed, for example "She was lived alone" instead of "She lived alone". In the first sentence, students added to be "was" before the verb "lived", in other words, students should not write tobe anymore. This result also similar with Majid (2014) the result from this research was 4,69% addition errors. It can be concluded that students still do not understand or are confused about sentence construction, so they add sentences that should not be there.

The last error was misordering, there were 4 or 3.25%. occurred because students misplaced the word, for example "Because only she lives alone" instead of "Because she only lived alone". The findings was this error is the lowest which similar with Setti (2018) has misordering error as much as 1%. When viewed from the results of student writing, it can be concluded that only a few students made this mistake because they were a little confused about the correct order of several sentences.

Conclusion

This research that has been conducted, information can be drawn that has been obtained related to the writing of narrative text students about errors in the use of simple past tense. First , there are four types of errors made by students, which consist of omission,

misformation, addition and misordering. Second, researcher found most of students was experiencing error were in the misformation , some students in the omission , a few students in addition and least in misordering.

This research is still very limited in error in finding the cause but it is hoped that researchers who will examine error analysis will add or find out what causes the error to occur with interviews. Then, the researcher hopes that this can be used as a reference that can help provide a little good information about analyzing student errors in writing narrative texts.

References

Anwar, S. (2014). *An error analysis on the use of simple past tense in students' narrative writing* (A case study at first grade students of SMA Dua Mei Ciputat).

Bieber, D. (1999). *Longman grammar of spoken and written English.* Pearson Education Limited.

Dulay, H. C.. Burt. M. K., & Krashen, S. (1982). *Language two.* Oxford University Press.

Fitria, S. A., Wennyta, W., & Ismiyati, Y. (2022). An Error Analysis of Using Simple Past Tense in Writing Narrative Text at Tenth Grade Students of Senior High School 1 Jambi. *JELT: Journal of English Language Teaching, 6*(1), 43-48.

Harmer, J. (2007). *How to teach English.* ELT Journal.

Huy, N. T. (2015). Problems affecting learning writing skill of grade 11 at Thong Linh High School. *Asian Journal of Educational Research, 3*(2), 53-69.

Majid, N. (2014). *Error analysis of the English narrative text written by the eleventh grade students of SMA Perguruan IslamMakassar.* https://digilibadmin.unismuh.ac.id/upload/21023-Full_Text.pdf

Pardosi, J. D., Karo, R. E. V. B., Sijabat, O. A. S., Pasaribu, H., &Tarigan, N. W. P. (2019). An error analysis of students in writing narrative text. *Linguistic English Education and Art (LEEA) Journal, 3*(1), 159-172. doi:https://doi.org/10.31539/leea.v3i1.983

Purap, M. S., & Purwono, A. (2021). Pengaruh program literasi terhadap keterampilan menulis siswa kelas IVa MI darussalam Pacet Mojokerto. *AU LADA: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Perkembangan Anak. e-ISSN:2656- 1638, Volume III,* (2).

Purwantini, S. (2022). Peningkatan keterampilan menulis narrative text dan aktivitas belajar siswa kelas ix-d melalui penerapan model pembelajaran concept sentence berbantuan gambar seri di SMP negeri 8 Madiun. *ACTION: Jurnal Inovasi Penelitian Tindakan Kelas dan Sekolah, 2*(4), 467-474. DOI: https://doi.org/10.51878/action.v2i4.1755

Ramdhani, M. I., & Amalia, S. (2018). Teaching writing through cinquain in EFL classroom:How?. *English Empower: Journal of Linguistics and*

Literature, 3(1),56-59.

Riska, A. (2019). An analysis of students'grammatical errors in writing narrative text at state junior high school 1 Keritang Tembilahan Indragiri Hilir *(Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Islam Negeri sultan Syarif Kasim Riau).*

Setti, W. A. (2018). *An Error Analysis On The Use Of Simple Past Tense In Narrative Text Made By The Third Semester Of English Department Students At Muhammadiyah University Of Makassar*